Some geometrical aspects of entanglement in Holography & CFT (from the lattice)



Erik Tonni SISSA



```
      C. De Nobili, A. Coser and E.T.
      [1604.02609]
      JSTAT

      P. Fonda, D. Seminara, E.T.
      [1510.03664]
      JHEP
```

First Zagreb School on Theoretical Physics

July 2017





Entanglement entropy



Quantum system in a state ρ

Bipartite Hilbert space

$$\mathcal{H} = \mathcal{H}_A \otimes \mathcal{H}_B$$

$$\rho_A \equiv \operatorname{Tr}_B \rho$$
$$S_A = -\operatorname{Tr}_A(\rho_A \log \rho_A)$$

Pure states: $S_A = S_B$

Entanglement entropy is a measure of the bipartite entanglement

Area law in QFT_d Important exceptions exist (e.g. 1 + 1 CFTs)

$$S_A \propto \frac{\operatorname{Area}(\partial A)}{\varepsilon^{d-2}} + \dots$$

Holographic Entanglement Entropy in AdS(4)/CFT(3)



 Various non trivial checks. E.g. strong subadditivity [Headrick, Takayanagi, (2007)]
 Simply connected domains analytically solved: spheres and infinite strips
 Domains A obtained as small perturbations of the sphere [Hubeny, (2012)] [Klebanov, Nishioka, Pufu, Safdi, (2012)] [Allais, Mezei, (2014)]

HEE in AdS(4) with Surface Evolver

Generic shape for ∂A [Fonda, Giomi, Salvio, E.T., (2014)] [Fonda, Seminara, E.T., (2015)] Numerical analysis based on *Surface Evolver* (developed by Ken Brakke) E.g.: when A is a disk



Domains with generic boundaries can be studied

a. 1



Minimal area surfaces in AdS(4)

Pathwise connected domains A(also with non smooth ∂A)



 \boldsymbol{z}

 \mathcal{Z}

Disjoint regions $(A = A_1 \cup A_2)$



HEE in AdS(4) & Willmore energy

Willmore energy of a closed smooth surface $\Sigma_g \subset \mathbb{R}^3$

$$\mathcal{W}[\Sigma_g] \equiv \frac{1}{4} \int_{\Sigma_g} \left(\mathrm{Tr} \widetilde{K} \right)^2 d\widetilde{\mathcal{A}}$$

[Willmore, (1965)]



Since $\mathcal{W}[\Sigma_g] \ge 4\pi$ (saturated only by round spheres) [Willmore, (1965)] HEE is maximised by the disk for a given perimeter P_A , i.e. $F_A \ge 2\pi$

HEE in asymptotically AdS(4) static spacetimes

[Fonda, Seminara, E.T., (2015)]

Take
$$ds^2|_{t=\text{const}} = g_{\mu\nu} dx^{\mu} dx^{\nu}$$
 with $g_{\mu\nu} = e^{2\varphi} \tilde{g}_{\mu\nu}$ and $\varphi = -\log(z) + \dots$

The metric $\tilde{g}_{\mu\nu}$ is asymptotically flat as $z \to 0$

 \bigcirc $\hat{\gamma}_A$ extremal area surface

$$\operatorname{Tr} K = 0 \qquad \Longleftrightarrow \qquad \left(\operatorname{Tr} \widetilde{K}\right)^2 = 4(\widetilde{n}^{\lambda} \partial_{\lambda} \varphi)^2$$

The unit vector \tilde{n}^{μ} is normal to $\hat{\gamma}_A \subset \tilde{\mathcal{M}}_3$ (defined by $\tilde{g}_{\mu\nu}$)

Generalising the result for AdS_4 , one finds

$$F_A = \int_{\hat{\gamma}_A} \left[\frac{1}{2} \left(\operatorname{Tr} \widetilde{K} \right)^2 + \widetilde{\nabla}^2 \varphi - e^{2\varphi} - \tilde{n}^{\mu} \tilde{n}^{\nu} \, \widetilde{\nabla}_{\mu} \widetilde{\nabla}_{\nu} \varphi \right] d\tilde{\mathcal{A}}$$

 AdS_4 : the formula involving the Willmore energy is recovered

HEE in asymptotically AdS(4) black holes



HEE in asymptotically AdS(4) black holes. Ellipses



HEE in asymptotically AdS(4) domain wall geometries

$$ds^{2} = \frac{1}{z^{2}} \left(\frac{-dt^{2} + dx^{2}}{p(z)} + dz^{2} \right) \qquad p(z) = \left[1 + (z/z_{\rm RG})^{\alpha} \right]^{2\gamma} \qquad \alpha > 0$$
$$\gamma > 0$$

Holographic $z/z_{\rm RG} \ll 1$ UV regime: AdS₄ with $L_{\rm UV} = 1$ RG flow $z/z_{\rm RG} \gg 1$ IR regime: AdS₄ with $L_{\rm IR} = 1/(1 + \gamma \alpha) < L_{\rm UV}$ [Freedman, Gubser, Pilch, Warner, (1999)] [Girardello, Petrini, Porrati, Zaffaroni, (1998); (1999)] HEE: see [Myers, Sinha, (2010)] [Albash, Johnson, (2010)] [Myers, Singh, (2012)] [Liu, Mezei, (2012)] Generic shapes [Fonda, Seminara, E.T., (2015)]



$$F_A = \int_{\hat{\gamma}_A} \frac{1}{z^2} \left[\left(1 + \frac{z \, p'(z)}{2 \, p(z)} \right) (\tilde{n}^z)^2 + \frac{z \, p'(z)}{2 \, p(z)} \right] d\tilde{\mathcal{A}}$$



Domain wall geometries: ellipses



Domain wall geometries: othe





Holographic mutual information in AdS(4)

$$I_{A_1,A_2} \equiv S_{A_1} + S_{A_2} - S_{A_1 \cup A_2} \equiv \frac{\mathcal{I}_{A_1,A_2}}{4G_N}$$

$$\mathcal{I}_{A_1,A_2} = F_{A_1 \cup A_2} - F_{A_1} - F_{A_2} + o(1)$$

Beyond a critical distance $\mathcal{I}_{A_1,A_2} = 0$ and the disconnected configuration



The Clifford torus minimises the Willmore energy among the genus one surfaces: $\mathcal{W}[\Sigma_1] \ge 2\pi^2$ [Willmore, (1965)] [Marques, Neves, (2012)] \longrightarrow It cannot be found in this holographic context [Fonda, Seminara, E.T., (2015)]

HEE in AdS(4). Polygons (1)

Infinite wedge with opening angle α ($|\phi| \leq \alpha/2$) [Drukker, Gross, Ooguri, (1999)] [Hirata, Takayanagi, (2006)]

$$z = \frac{\rho}{f(\phi)} \phi = \int_{f_0}^f \frac{1}{\zeta} \left[(\zeta^2 + 1) \left(\frac{\zeta^2(\zeta^2 + 1)}{f_0^2(f_0^2 + 1)} - 1 \right) \right]^{-\frac{1}{2}} d\zeta \quad f_0$$











HEE in AdS(4). Polygons (II)

Area of the minimal surfaces anchored on polygons [Drukker, Gross, Ooguri, (1999)]

$$\mathcal{A}_{A} = \frac{P_{A}}{\varepsilon} - B_{A} \log(P_{A}/\varepsilon) - W_{A} + o(1) \equiv \frac{P_{A}}{\varepsilon} - \widetilde{B}_{A} \log(P_{A}/\varepsilon)$$

$$W_{A} \text{ influenced}$$
by the regularization
$$B_{A} \equiv 2 \sum_{i=1}^{N} b(\alpha_{i}) \qquad b(\alpha) \equiv \int_{0}^{\infty} \left(1 - \sqrt{\frac{\zeta^{2} + f_{0}^{2} + 1}{\zeta^{2} + 2f_{0}^{2} + 1}}\right) d\zeta$$

Numerical checks with Surface Evolver [Fonda, Giomi, Salvio, E.T., (2014)]



Mutual Information & Entanglement Negativity



Entanglement between disjoint regions: Negativity

$$\rho = \rho_{A_1 \cup A_2} \text{ is a mixed state}$$

$$\rho^{T_2} \text{ is the partial transpose of } \rho$$

$$\langle e_i^{(1)} e_j^{(2)} | \rho^{T_2} | e_k^{(1)} e_l^{(2)} \rangle = \langle e_i^{(1)} e_l^{(2)} | \rho | e_k^{(1)} e_j^{(2)} \rangle \quad (|e_i^{(k)}\rangle \text{ base of } \mathcal{H}_{A_k})$$

$$[\text{Peres, (1996)] [Zyczkowski, Horodecki, Sanpera, Lewenstein, (1998)] [Lee, Kim, Park, Lee, (2000)]$$

$$[\text{Eisert, (2001)] [Vidal, Werner, (2002)] [Plenio, (2005)]}$$

$$Trace norm \qquad \left| |\rho^{T_2}|| = \text{Tr} |\rho^{T_2}| = \sum_i |\lambda_i| = 1 - 2 \sum_{\lambda_i < 0} \lambda_i \right| \quad \lambda_j \text{ eigenvalues of } \rho^{T_2} \\ \text{Tr} \rho^{T_2} = 1 \right| Logarithmic negativity \qquad \left| \mathcal{E}_{A_2} = \ln ||\rho^{T_2}|| = \ln \text{Tr} |\rho^{T_2}| \right|$$

Bipartite system $\mathcal{H} = \mathcal{H}_1 \otimes \mathcal{H}_2$ in any state ρ

$$\mathcal{E}_1 = \mathcal{E}_2$$

Replica approach to Negativity

[Calabrese, Cardy, E.T., (2012)]

$$\square A \text{ parity effect for } \mathbf{Tr}(\rho^{T_2})^{n_e} = \sum_i \lambda_i^{n_e} = \sum_{\lambda_i > 0} |\lambda_i|^{n_e} + \sum_{\lambda_i < 0} |\lambda_i|^{n_e}$$
$$\mathrm{Tr}(\rho^{T_2})^{n_o} = \sum_i \lambda_i^{n_o} = \sum_{\lambda_i > 0} |\lambda_i|^{n_o} - \sum_{\lambda_i < 0} |\lambda_i|^{n_o}$$

Analytic continuation on the even sequence $Tr(\rho^{T_2})^{n_e}$ (make 1 an even number)

$$\mathcal{E} = \lim_{n_e \to 1} \log \left[\operatorname{Tr}(\rho^{T_2})^{n_e} \right]$$

$$\lim_{n_o \to 1} \operatorname{Tr}(\rho^{T_2})^{n_o} = \operatorname{Tr} \rho^{T_2} = 1$$

ure states
$$\rho = |\Psi\rangle\langle\Psi|$$
 and *bipartite* system $(\mathcal{H} = \mathcal{H}_1 \otimes \mathcal{H}_2)$

$$Tr(\rho^{T_2})^n = \begin{cases} Tr \rho_2^n & n = n_o & \text{odd} \\ (Tr \rho_2^{n/2})^2 & n = n_e & \text{even} \end{cases}$$
Schmidt decomposition
Taking $n_e \to 1$ we have
$$\mathcal{E} = 2\log \text{Tr}\rho_2^{1/2} \quad (\text{Renyi entropy } 1/2)$$

Negativity in a 2D harmonic lattice: Adjacent regions

$$H = \sum_{\substack{1 \le i \le L_x \\ 1 \le j \le L_y}} \left\{ \frac{p_{i,j}^2}{2M} + \frac{M\omega^2}{2} q_{i,j}^2 + \frac{K}{2} \left[\left(q_{i+1,j} - q_{i,j} \right)^2 + \left(q_{i,j+1} - q_{i,j} \right)^2 \right] \right\}$$

The partial transpose w.r.t. A_2 is obtained by sending $p_i \rightarrow -p_i$ in A_2 [Simon, (2000)] [Audenaert, Eisert, Plenio, Werner, (2002)]

We consider the massless case in the thermodynamic limit. Adjacent regions: e.g. two adjacent rectangles [Eisler, Zimboras, (2015)] [De Nobili, Coser, E.T., (2016)]



Negativity in a 2D harmonic lattice: Area law (I)



Negativity in a 2D harmonic lattice: Area law (II)

Moments of the partial transpose

$$\mathcal{E}_n \equiv \log\left(\frac{\operatorname{Tr}(\rho_A^{T_2})^n}{\operatorname{Tr}\rho_A^n}\right) = a_n P_{\text{shared}} + \dots \qquad \longrightarrow \qquad \underset{n_e \to 1}{\longrightarrow} \mathcal{E}$$

Area law behaviour due to local effects close to $\partial A_1 \cap \partial A_2$

$$a_n = \begin{cases} (1 - n_o) \tilde{a}_{n_o} & \text{odd } n = n_o \\ 2(1 - n_e/2) \tilde{a}_{n_e/2} & \text{even } n = n_e \end{cases}$$

The coefficient a_n is related to the coefficient of the area law of the Rényi entropies $S_A^{(n)} = \tilde{a}_n P_A + \dots$



Negativity in a 2D harmonic lattice: Corner contributions

Only the vertices of $\partial A_1 \cap \partial A_2$ contribute to a (universal) logarithmic term When only vertices corresponding to bipartitions or tripartitions of 2π occur

$$\mathcal{E} = a P_{\text{shared}} - \left(\sum_{\substack{\text{vertices of} \\ \partial A_1 \cap \partial A_2}} b(\theta_i^{(1)}, \theta_i^{(2)}) \right) \log P_{\text{shared}} + \dots$$

Similar expression for \mathcal{E}_n : corner function $b_n(\theta_i^{(1)}, \theta_i^{(2)})$ Vertices corresponding to explementary angles

$$\tilde{b}_{n}(\theta) \text{ corner function of } S_{A}^{(n)}$$

$$b_{n}(\theta, 2\pi - \theta) = \begin{cases} (1 - n_{o}) \tilde{b}_{n_{o}}(\theta) \\ 2(1 - n_{e}/2) \tilde{b}_{n_{e}/2}(\theta) \end{cases}$$

$$\Rightarrow \left(b(\theta, 2\pi - \theta) = \tilde{b}_{1/2}(\theta) \right)$$



Negativity in a 2D harmonic lattice: Corner contributions

Vertices corresponding to tripartitions of 2π





On the corner contributions to negativity in the continuum

$$\mathcal{E}_n = \alpha_n \frac{P_{\text{shared}}}{\varepsilon} - \left(\sum_{\substack{\text{vertices of}\\\partial A_1 \cap \partial A_2}} b_n(\theta_i^{(1)}, \theta_i^{(2)})\right) \log(P_{\text{shared}}/\varepsilon) + \dots$$

The combination $\mathcal{E} - I_{A_1,A_2}^{(1/2)}/2$ and its generalisation $\left\{ \right.$

$$\begin{cases} \mathcal{E}_{n_o} - (1 - n_o) I_{A_1, A_2}^{(n_o)} / 2 \\ \mathcal{E}_{n_e} - (1 - n_e / 2) I_{A_1, A_2}^{(n_e / 2)} \end{cases}$$

are UV finite for these kinds of configurations



Some other results on entanglement negativity

- finite temperature in CFTs [Calabrese, Cardy, E.T., (2014)] massive field theory [Calabrese, Cardy, E.T., (2012)] [Blondeau-Fournier, Castro-Alvaredo, Doyon (2015)] critical Ising model [Calabrese, Tagliacozzo, E.T., (2013)] [Alba, (2013)] moments of the partial transpose on the lattice via correlators [Eisler, Zimboras, (2015)] [Coser, E.T., Calabrese, (2015)] free fermions: moments of the partial transpose [Coser, E.T., Calabrese, (2015)] [Herzog, Wang, (2016)] Kondo model [Bayat, Sodano, Bose, (2010)] [Bayat, Bose, Sodano, Johannesson, (2012)] CFTs with boundaries [Calabrese, Cardy, E.T., (2012)] results for holographic models [Rangamani, Rota, (2014)] [Kulaxizi, Parnachev, Policastro, (2014)] evolution after a quantum quench [Eisler, Zimboras, (2014)] [Coser, E.T., Calabrese, (2014)] [Hoogeveen, Doyon, (2014)] [Wen, Chang, Ryu, (2015)]topological systems (toric code) [Lee, Vidal, (2013)] [Castelnovo, (2013)] two dimensional lattice models [Eisler, Zimboras, (2015)]
 - [Sherman, Devakul, Hastings, Singh, (2015)]
 - spin S one dimensional Valence Bond State [Santos, Korepin, (2016)]

Conclusions & open issues

Holographic entanglement entropy in AdS_4/CFT_3 : a generalized Willmore functional occurs at O(1) of S_A as $\varepsilon \to 0$

Entanglement negativity of adjacent domains in a 2D massless harmonic lattice: area law & corner contributions

Some open issues:



- Higher dimensions
- \rightarrow QFT analysis of negativity in 2 + 1 and higher dimensional CFT

Interactions



Negativity in AdS/CFT



